

# FINAL

## **P&T Rebuttal/Appeal by Department Chair**

**Principle:** A negative recommendation by the SOM P&T Committee represents a de facto difference of opinion between two deliberative bodies, one the Departmental P&T Committee, represented by the Department Chair, and the other the SOM P&T Committee. If we begin with the premise that reasonable people can disagree as to the evaluation of a candidate's merit, or even perhaps the interpretation of guidelines for evaluating merit, it makes sense to provide a mechanism for contesting the recommendation of the SOM P&T Committee.

1. The SOM P&T Committee considers the candidates credentials and accomplishments, deliberates and votes. A written review outlining the basis for the recommendation is produced.
2. In the event of a negative recommendation by the SOM P&T Committee the Department Chair will be informed as soon as possible and made aware of the basis for the negative recommendation by means of a meeting with the Chair of the SOM P&T Committee and provision of the written review.
3. The Department Chair has the option of requesting a meeting with the SOM P&T Committee and presenting a rebuttal. The basis for the rebuttal would be provided to the committee in writing one week prior to the meeting. The Department Chair (or the Chair's designee) will then meet with the SOM P&T Committee and present the rebuttal argument. This presentation may be followed by questions from members of the P&T Committee.
4. The SOM P&T Committee will then reconsider the candidate, vote a second time and a written record of the meeting will be produced, to include the Department Chair's rebuttal and a summary of the committee discussion. This report will be forwarded to the Dean along with the initial report and the committee's final recommendation.
5. In the event that, following a rebuttal by the Department Chair, a negative recommendation is forwarded, the Dean will offer the Department Chair an opportunity to appeal the recommendation. The appeal will be heard by the Dean.
6. Based on the recommendation of the SOM P&T Committee, the written and verbal rebuttal and the appeal, the Dean will render the final recommendation that will be forwarded to the Provost.